

SUSTAINABILITY COMMITTEE MEETING
NOVEMBER 2, 2011

Chairwoman Minarik called a Sustainability Committee Meeting for Wednesday, November 2, 2011 at 6:00 PM in the Euclid Municipal Center Council Chamber.

AGENDA

Recycling Update

- Forming a Citizens Committee to create a Pay-As-You-Throw (PAYT) plan
- Charging extra for over-size items

Members Present: Holzheimer Gail, Jones, Langman, Scarniench, Minarik

Others Present: Director Frey, Councilman O'Neill, Councilman Van Ho, Clerk of Council Cahill.

Chairwoman Minarik – This meeting was called because we had a meeting in June where we discussed Pay as You Throw programming. We had a presentation and with the season wrapping up it was the committee's desire to get a recap on that along with a few other events going on.

The first item on the agenda we will talk about the recycling update. Then we will discuss forming a citizen's committee to create a pay as you throw program. Then we will also discuss charging extra for oversized items. We will try to be out of here by 6:45 so that we have time for the Executive & Finance Committee meeting. Since Mr. Bock is not here, Director Frey, do you want to address the recycling?

Director Frey – Director Bock is at a medical appointment with his father in Erie and unable to attend today's meeting. He told me he provided you a spreadsheet for December 2010 and through September 2011 showing monthly totals of tons recycled with the corresponding revenue. And then all of the operational costs including the amortization of the capital assets involved. It is his opinion that the net cost after revenue and tipping fees that are foregone as a result of the recycling that our average monthly cost is just under \$3,000. Obviously in 2011 that difference is made up by the Energy grant that was applied to that. For purposes of highlighting we have arranged in monthly tons recycled from a low of 108.5 tons in the month of April it looks like January was the highest at 144.7 tons. Maybe that makes sense giving post-holiday period. I know that Director Bock indicated that he was attempting to get educational material from the County Solid Waste District that would be reproduced, published and distributed through the recycling grant, the Litter Control Grant is more appropriately named, as well as a requirement of our contract with our trash hauler J&J Refuse. Clearly there is going to need to be additional educational efforts so that long term we don't have a negative cost, a monthly cost associated with the recycling.

On the other hand, as a resident spending if this is accurate and predictive of future recycling activities, spending \$36,000 to remove hundreds of thousands really of tons of recycled material from the landfill is probably a very good environmental investment. We know that we can and will do more on the educational side to try to drive the amount of recycling.

One thing we should note, we may not hit the same tonnage goals as communities are size but we have a pretty aggressive newsprint recycling that is outside of this with Petpals and at Shore and various private entities that have the ABITIBI recycling. We divert an awful lot of print material from what would otherwise be part of our tonnage. I know that newsprint prices fluctuate pretty widely and that is part of ABITIBI's challenge to consistently stay afloat if you will is the fact that there is such variations in recycled newsprint values.

We have a ways to go. We want to turn that just about \$3,000 a month net cost to the city into a break even or a positive revenue stream. Most importantly we want to make sure that we continue to offer effective recycling program for our residents. I'd be glad to go over this spreadsheet. I apologize, I'm looking at it and see that it does not total by year-to-date on the right hand column for 2011. As you can see we're probably recycling an average of about 130 tons a month.

Councilwoman Scarniench – Director Frey, the tipping fee. All we're saving is one truck? That's the cost of one truck's tipping fee, correct; the \$40 it was \$39?

Director Frey – That is per ton. I'm pretty certain the tipping fee is a per ton fee that's charged.

Councilwoman Scarniench – That would mean the value of savings from reduction in landfill that would be where that averages out?

Director Frey – It should, yes.

President Holzheimer Gail – Director Frey, you may not have this but do we have any indication of how ABITIBI bins have been doing? Do we get any report on the amount of paper they are collecting?

Director Frey – I know we do, but I don't know what those numbers are and I'd be happy to get those numbers and provide them to Council.

President Holzheimer Gail – The only reason I ask and that was a concern when we started our own recycling program that it would have a negative impact on the community agencies that were not counting but the income from that was beneficial to them. I just was curious as to whether they saw a drop off in their papers based on our own program. I don't have the old budget book in front of me but the figure I remember from the last time we did curbside recycling was about \$380,000.

Director Frey – I don't have the budget book either. I thought the number was close to a quarter of a million, but it is substantially higher than these numbers.

President Holzheimer Gail – That was the last I remembered and maybe that was under the current contract and when we decided not to do it. But even if it was \$250,000 we're certainly providing that service much more cost effectively.

Director Frey – If you recall, this refuse hauling contract has the dual component of the per household pick up component and the tipping fee and that makes it considerably different from the contract that we had with Republic Services where we were paying on a per house basis alone. There is a better driver in this contract to encourage recycling.

President Holzheimer Gail – I know we're going to get to the citizens committee but I think one of things perhaps the citizens committee could help us with is maybe some more creative marketing strategies or ideas. Just sending out a newsletter is not enough. If we could spend sometime ourselves brainstorming that or make perhaps one of the charges of the citizens committee, I know education would be needed if we would go to a pay as you throw as well.

Chairwoman Minarik – That is huge with the citizens committee to figure out how do we get the message into the community. I don't think the community is still grasping how much money recycling can save the city in tonnage and tipping fees and all of that stuff. I was at a neighborhood meeting last night and following up on your point, Director Bock implied that ABITIBI maybe leaving the city because they're not getting the paper or they're changing or something.

Director Frey – I know the number of ABITIBI customers have had difficulty with them in not coming to collect the bins, that they're jammed and people are dissuaded from continuing to use them because they are not dumped often enough. I know they had some financial issues that they were working through. I believe the Court system on trying to reformat some of their agreements. Newsprint is a pretty volatile commodity and it maybe in better financial shape today than it was a year ago.

Chairwoman Minarik – But the recycling is not what's causing ABITIBI to think about leaving?

Director Frey – Not that I'm aware of. I think they have much larger issues than the City of Euclid.

Councilman Langman – Law Director Frey, about this time last year we talked about education and so forth and Director Smith indicated that he would share the educational efforts and now you say we're still working on education. So what have we done in the past year beyond what we did when we dropped the bins and the newsletter?

Director Frey – We've tried to create a sense of awareness through our public information outreach on our city website and on our new message board. I don't believe we've done anything more directly or that had greater penetration into the neighborhood associations. I think that's an area where we clearly can improve. I don't think anybody is going to suggest that we reached our maximum response from our residents on recycling. We have to look not only internally on how we communicate the recycling message but perhaps as Council President has indicated, this committee of residents can be tasked with looking at practices in other communities that really drive their recycling programs. I can speak from my household, we recycle with a vengeance and it makes a considerable difference in the amount of trash that we discard. I think there's much more that can be done to spread that message so that it is more widely used. I know at one point we were indicating that we had a participation rate of about 30% of the households. We've got a long way to go. If we can drive that participation percentage up, particularly as we get into these more historic heavier months around the holiday period, I think that will be a good time to really give that a boost, that educational process a boost. I can't speak to, other than the message board, other than our city website, I can't speak to and I know we've included it into city newsletters that have been mailed out, but I can't speak to a recycling specific program that we have undertaken other than those efforts.

Councilman Langman – The reason why I bring that up is because again when we talked about this initially, the federal grant was supposed to be the bridge to a no cost program. Now I'm hearing from you that the administration is okay with a certain level of loss per year. But that was not illustrated at that time. I am concerned that by the time you convene a citizens committee, which will be after the election and you will have the holidays and it is going to take awhile to get going, we will now tolerate losses into a certain amount of period into the new year and that is not how the program was sold. I want to see something besides message boards and newsletter that say we're really going to educate our residents so that this can truly be a break even program. Otherwise, you could raise the question, we could have used the grant for something else, something of a longer term nature.

Director Frey – Councilman, I respectfully, I'm stating to you and to the members of this committee my opinion and my limited knowledge on what efforts we've undertaken. I also acknowledge that we can do more. It was my opinion that a \$3,000 a month net cost after amortizing equipment and fuel and employee costs, in my opinion is a remarkable achievement in keeping thousands of tons of material out of our landfill. Clearly we can do better, there is not a single person who would disagree with that, that we can do better. If our participation rate is 30% and we can double that to 60%, then we're making money. That's the goal we have to shoot for, I would absolutely agree with you on that.

Councilman Langman – Okay but we've had a year and we're no further along than we were last year when we talked about this. Again, great, recycling is fantastic, I've supported it every time the city has brought it back, but it was sold to the Council as certain things would happen on the educational side which have not happen. I don't think that's too much to ask for the administration after a year to see what the plan is to increase participation. A year's time is more than enough. Whether it is through a citizens committee or something within the administration, fantastic, but a year is much, much too long, especially when it was sold as no cost.

Chairwoman Minarik – I would like to recognize Councilman Van Ho and go ahead.

Councilman Van Ho – Law Director, why can't we do something simple with that money like have some magnets made? I'm not near as involved in recycling as like Councilwoman Minarik is. I don't always know what can be thrown out. The Mayor always uses the example of throw your toothpaste box out and I had never really thought much about toothpaste boxes. We could have some type of a magnet that goes onto the refrigerator, not everybody has a computer but I think most folks would have a refrigerator that would tell them what is recyclable. That would be a good start and you would get a tremendous increase.

Chairwoman Minarik – It would have to be a very large magnet.

Councilman Van Ho – Fine, if it is a large magnet, it is a large magnet, that way you know.

Director Frey – Councilman I will forward that suggestion onto Director Bock tomorrow.

Councilwoman Scarniench – Director Frey, I hate to ask you, put you on the seat, employee overtime hours, that's where our costs are. If we didn't have those overtime, we would actually be in the black.

Director Frey – We're going to have some overtime in part, weather will create some of those circumstances. You have to remember we pick up recycling on the same day as we pick up trash. Some of those days where we have a holiday that is not recognized by J&J, we have our recycling crew working a holiday, so that is premium time.

Councilwoman Scarniench – Do you know how many times our trucks have been down?

Director Frey – I don't know the answer, I'd be happy to ask Director Bock to provide that information.

Councilwoman Scarniench – It would be interesting to see how many times our trucks were down. Even when the trucks are down, we still have to pay. The other question and it will be the last question, how many different employees have we had in this operation over the last year?

Director Frey – I can tell you for certain we've had 5 and I don't know whether it has been more than five. We've had five; two of the individuals, one now works at Senior Programs and the other works in the Engineering Dept. It is a great entry position into city service. As you're aware, we're now requiring those individuals to work on recycling to come in with a commercial driving license so it makes them very marketable internally as we have openings in some of the other departments that require CDL operators. We've got our internal source of candidates there.

Councilwoman Scarniench – You mentioned two, isn't there a third? Didn't somebody just get the job at Waste Water from there?

Director Frey – It's possible, I don't know that.

Councilwoman Scarniench – It seems like we're constantly training somebody, which I think would be part of the problem as far as overtime because you're training people all of the time.

Director Frey – These are not the highest paid city positions.

Councilwoman Scarniench – Correct, but they know that going in also.

Director Frey – Right they do. But we don't want to limit their opportunities for personal advancement either when those opportunities occur. We did have the fellow who I believe went to Senior Programs was because he was unable/unwilling or just didn't want to get a CDL. He's not in that position any longer and I understood he was a real hustler, but.

Councilwoman Scarniench – Just to go back on that, with all the people that we have laid off over the past few years, why would we give somebody who is brand new an opportunity to go to another position before we give it to someone who worked here for more years? Or do we do that?

Director Frey – Most of the union positions have specific recall positions in their collective bargaining agreements. Typically they are given first opportunity for recall within their bargaining units. We have made an effort to try to advance individuals because of performance and make that a real premium in our determinations on who advances to higher paying positions. Without knowing any of the individuals and I don't know any of the individuals, I'm hesitant to tell you that this person was transferred to a new job because of, I don't have that information.

Councilwoman Scarniench – It is just one of those things, okay thank you.

Councilwoman Jones – Director Frey, I'm not sure if you can answer this question or not, or maybe I could just ask the question and you can relay it to Director Bock. In the past I have asked about Shore Cultural Centre and recycling products there. I talked with Ms. Kidder and Sarah from Shore Cultural Centre and they're willing to distribute the bins within the building if there could be a pick up at Shore Cultural Centre for the recycled products. I'm sure that with all the activities and people going in and out of that building, there's quite a few recycled products that can be collected and added to our tonnage. We're going to go out and educate residents on recycling, we as a city and our city buildings need to be doing the same thing.

Director Frey- I know that we do recycle at our Service Garage and I know we recycle in this building. I'm aware that Shore is not using the city's trash hauling contractor. I'll talk to Director Bock and see if we can't figure out how to get them into that process because it is our truck that is going to make the recycling pick up. I'll talk to him about how we can incorporate that.

Chairwoman Minarik – The Solid Waste District Annual Report came out and it listed the communities and how much they're recycling. In terms of the marketing, Director Frey, it might be good to contact some of the communities that recycle like Brecksville which recycles 68.9%, between solid waste disposed 2010 materials recycled. Perhaps we could go to some of these communities that have large recycling percentages and see what they're doing to teach their residents, unless it is mandatory of course.

Director Frey – I think you're absolutely right. That's exactly my point before, we need to look at those practices in those communities that really drive recycling. I think we'd be naïve to think that economics don't help that as well. People in higher income levels are probably more inclined to recycled. It is with so many things where the education is a big part of that. We've made an effort here to recognize alternate energy in our kiosk, in the lobby. We need to keep expanding that. We need to expand it in our schools so that kids are learning to recycle at an early age. I talked with my son about that when he was in high school about the need to make that a dramatic part of the educational processes is recycling at the schools. I don't know how our public and private schools do with that, but that's an area where we really need to address an education component as well.

Chairwoman Minarik – That will lead us to the next point where if we could have a financial incentive for people to recycle maybe they will. Which is the second part of the agenda that we were talking about tonight is forming a citizens committee to create a pay as you throw, PAYT, plan. Briefly, Councilman Van Ho, you did not get this, but what I want the Committee to do tonight because we're not going to set

it up tonight or implement it tonight, we just don't have the time. But there is a 46 page report out of the Commonwealth of Massachusetts Department of Environmental Protection, it was written in 2004. It is 46 page guide on implementing a solid waste unit based pricing program, implementing a pay as you throw program. Very detailed and it really explains why we need a citizens committee to look at every angle of it. The Committee has received an executive summary of it. Director Frey has one, anyone that wants the full report, I can email the PDF, so you can take a look at it. That will get our heads rolling as to when we start asking people to sign on, what it is the responsibility they will have. The major problem with pay as you throw is not educating the public that it is coming, not letting them know that they will now be paying for what they throw out.

That leads us to the third point on the agenda, see we are trying to get out of here quickly, which is to at least for the beginning, is to begin charging extra for oversized items. I believe all of Council received a photo today of lawn furniture or furniture that was put out on a tree lawn. We have seen mattresses thrown out, we've seen couches, we see it all the time where tree lawns are over loaded with huge heavy stuff that is not in compliance with our garbage pick up which says 50 pounds max. I would like to start at least charging people when they are over the 50 pound limit.

Previously I had past out, I've given you all examples of tags where residents go to City Hall, or Drug Mart, CVS, whatever, but they actually purchase a bulk item label. The City charges for it, the city gets the money, people now begin to understand that they are going to pay for what they throw out. The intent of pay as you throw is to change a person's thought process into recognizing that trash is similar to a utility. You're responsible for what you throw out, it promotes fairness, equality, it makes people responsible for their lifestyle. We can't really do anything about this tonight unless you would like to put this before the end of the session which is November 30th but I don't think it will happen. What's your pleasure, what do you think?

Councilman Langman – I think if we're going to implement something like that it has to be well planned, well thought out. There are lots of variables involved. One of the first things is, you mentioned 50 pound limit, did you mean per container or bag or in total? I think too, we're going to have to analyze how many of these bulk items that have value are being taken by scrappers even though Law Director Frey will back me up, that's illegal but it does happen. If somebody can find value and take this versus our waste hauler hauling away all this stuff, that's an important component to it too. Just exactly how often does it happen, do it happen only when somebody moves out of a single family residence. Number two, is it actually our waste hauler taking most of the stuff, couches or metals? Or is it being handled by scrappers?

Chairwoman Minarik – In order to do that we would have to follow the scrappers and since they're already illegal, then we would start penalizing them, right?

Councilman Langman – Not at all, you would have to have J&J do a survey of exactly what they're picking up, how many bulk items are being handled. Would they do that or would they ask more money to do that? Then there are also issues with, okay I'm going to throw away an old chair or couch, how do I get charged? Who charges? Do I just put it on the curb and it magically disappears and I get a bill in the mail? Or do I have to come down to City Hall if it is not taken away? How do we work with a waste hauler to manage that particular scenario?

Chairwoman Minarik – I know how stickers work is you'd come to city hall, say it is at city hall, you'd buy "x" number of stickers or whatever when you're throwing it out. You put it on that say a mattress. If J&J does not see a sticker on that mattress they do not take it. From what we heard from the previous presentation in June we would probably hire some part-timers to follow around, warn residents or let them know the reason it didn't get picked up is because you need to buy a sticker. Three strikes and you're out; we will start citing you for that. I think that's a first step in teaching people about reducing, reusing and recycling. What you're thinking is put that into the citizens committee as well?

Councilman Langman – I think you're going to have to only because it is a big change from, you have residents that have been here for generations, or not generations but many, many decades. They're used to here, put it on the curb and here it goes away. To change that kind of thinking and as Law Director Frey points out, it is a little tougher maybe in a community like Euclid. So the educational component really has to be nailed down. That is why the committee will serve us very well. That way when you roll it out, most of the glitches would be thought of and you can have a smooth roll out of it.

Councilman O'Neill – It is more of an observation than anything else. I do believe there should be a committee formed to review this. Basically what you're saying is, if I'm correct in understanding, we're kind of reducing a service that we offer right now to the residents. I know the residents do complain, they feel their taxes are high in the city and now we are reducing a service that we've been offering for a long time to the residents and that's more of an observation and I'm certainly willing to talk about it.

As far as stickers go, I'm not sure how adhesive they are. But what's to stop somebody in the middle of the night to go by and snag a sticker because they need it for their garbage? Now you have the midnight sticker robber. What's to stop the person from dumping the garage, if they're paying to have it picked up, dumping it on a vacant lot? These things need to be discussed.

Chairwoman Minarik – These things do need to be discussed but we are not offering that service for free any more of unlimited trash pick up. We are charging residents now, \$108 a year.

Councilman O'Neill – But they pick up everything and that's a service we provide.

Chairwoman Minarik – Yes but a little old lady or like myself who only puts out a small bag every week, that's what we're trying to do is make it equitable. Make it an American system, not a Russian system.

Councilman O'Neill – I'm not on this committee, but it is just a comment. There are other things that people pay for in the city that they don't necessarily use. I don't use the pools, but I pay to recreation. There's a lot of different things that happen in the city and it is certainly worth reviewing, absolutely, I agree with you and we have to improve our efforts on education to the public because we can definitely do better than 30%. Possibly what works for one city, maybe it won't work here but we're looking at the way other cities do things and then figure our niche, what is going to work for us. I certainly think that if you can create some type of competition with kids coming out of the schools, recycling and spread the word that way to their parents, I think it would be a positive effort in the direction of creating more recycling.

Chairwoman Minarik – Similar to if we could be as aggressive teaching children to recycle as we are at telling their parents to quit smoking.

Councilman O'Neill – I don't smoke, I never did.

Chairwoman Minarik – It would get very annoying and parents would start recycling.

Councilman O'Neill – I think certainly we should reach out to the schools, I know they have health classes and this could be considered part of health. Maybe we come up with some type of curriculum with a certain age group, target the younger ages and working with the school district and get them educated and bring that knowledge home. That's my comment, thank you.

Councilman Van Ho – I have two comments. First of all, is this going to negatively impact the city's cash flow or treasury or however you want to say it by doing this pay as you throw? Because if it is, I'm not willing to sacrifice the money. Number two, when we talk about the fairness part of it, the little old lady that has one bag, I never used the police or haven't had to do so far, so should I not have to pay for the police? I haven't had the fire people either so, should I be able to not pay for the fire people as much as the people who have had a fire? I think we can carry fairness to an illogical extreme. Isn't it like \$18 a month or so that we're charging?

Chairwoman Minarik - \$9.

Councilman Van Ho - \$9 doesn't strike me that we're going to be putting little old ladies out on the sidewalk by their garage because they can't afford it.

Chairwoman Minarik – But we also do not subsidize people, if someone wants to keep their home at 68, they pay that bill. Some people who don't want to pay that much, they reduce the temperature.

Councilman Van Ho – That's not a city function though.

Chairwoman Minarik – It is the same type of principle. That's reserved for the committee.

Councilman Van Ho – No, it is not a city function and if we're going to do anything at all, I would like to see us take our time because the one thing that bothers me is the money end of this thing. I do not want the city taking a hit and having to lay off additional people so that grandma can pay \$8 instead of \$9.

Chairwoman Minarik – That is part of what needs to be looked at, is to make sure, I think right now we're paying \$2.5 million a year for trash. So the more we can recycle, we can reduce that amount. The biggest cost to the trash program is the per stop fee, it is not so much the tonnage. That kind of puts us in a spot. But, if we can look at other communities that have implemented PAYT and the number of companies and they're not a lot, I'm sure there's more out there, seem to say implementing some type of PAYT program

does reduce tonnage. Then the numbers would have to be looked at, of course, to see if it is viable. Some people under a true PAYT program would actually pay more than \$100 a year than the tax they're paying now, excuse me, the fee that they're paying now. Other people would pay much less. Again, there's going to be winners and I think a committee really needs to explore all of these. Pricing needs to be set, all of that type of stuff. How do we go about setting up a committee? Do we send out a call to people, what do we do? Should we have a date for when we have this committee in place?

Councilwoman Scarniench – When I put my committee together to talk about healthcare, it was simply this is what I want to do, anybody who is interested, please call me and they did. You give it a timeframe. I will go along with putting this committee together, but I too agree with my colleagues. Anywhere that I've talked about this, nobody wanted to hear about it, not even the little old lady who only had the one bag. We are charging a fee right now. We've been doing it this way forever. Sometimes doing it the same way is okay. It is a service that we have always provided in this city and I think by charging people this way, you're going to send more people out of here. That's just my belief in it. I'm willing to go ahead with the committee because I know committees work if they do what they need to do. Sometime in the Spring we can talk, put a timeline on what you're trying to do and talk about it then. As far as I'm concerned right now, this is not something I would vote for.

Chairwoman Minarik – I know I have people that have called that are opposed to it that want to be on a committee and people that are for it that want to be on a committee which would make it a very good committee in my opinion.

Councilwoman Jones – I agree that all of these discussions need to go to this committee to form. I don't want to have additional charges for a resident that is putting out bulk items for, and they're already paying the \$9 a month now for garbage collection. If we're going to have bulk items an additional charge in addition to that, I'd rather for it to go to the committee. There could be some ways where we could reduce maybe the current fee by these additional bulk items. Also I think the committee can look at, there could be maybe some type of bulk item person that picks up things, not a city worker but somebody we can contract with that would come in and pick up bulk item type of things. We can talk whether there would be a fee or not, but we need to look at that as well. I'm sure there's somebody out there that can use these things are take them somewhere away to wherever they need to go.

Also when we're talking about education for recycling, is when we could also open this up to get more resident feedback as far as bulk items. As we're educating them on recycling, talk to them about bulk items and different ways to be able to handle that. If they start that communication flow through the residents while we're doing the recycling education part.

I am interested in this committee and I would like to be on that committee. Also think we need to include a mix population for this committee and it needs to include landlords. Most of the times that you'll see a lot of items that was in the picture on the tree lawns is when somebody is either moving out for whatever reasons and maybe landlords can be on this committee as well to get their insight and opinions, suggestions or ideas.; as well as residents and business owners.

Councilman Langman – Just some final comments. By reducing tonnage which is what we're really after here, we save the city money. I think this program might have merit to it because it gets people to think and they recycle more that helps us with that particular program. I think there is potential for this program to serve the city very well. Clearly tipping fees are not going down each year, they are going to continue to go up as we run out of room to dump stuff. That will put continuous upward pressure on the cost of disposing of trash. In the future, near future, later future, that trash fee might have to be changed to reflect the growing cost of just doing things the way we have. A citizens committee is a good first step to analyze to see whether such a program can work here in the city. Again anything that can save money, save our fees for disposing of trash, and increase recycling, has to be looked at. I want to thank you for continuing to drive this process forward.

Chairwoman Minarik – What date is a good timeframe for people to volunteer? How large of a committee do you want?

Councilwoman Jones – There needs to be a date picked to say that responses by this date and I would say responses maybe by end of December and maybe have the first meeting after the holiday.

Chairwoman Minarik – How large do you think the committee should be to be effective? Seven?

President Holzheimer Gail – I think you want to make sure you have a broad representation of residents, businesses, people who are knowledgeable but be mindful that too large of a committee gets unwieldy but you have to build in, some people are going to miss a meeting. My sense would be 12-15 to start with knowing that you're not going to get everybody every time and being aware that you want some different

Sustainability Committee Meeting

November 2, 2011

Page 8

interests represented. The resident who emailed has some experience at the knowledge in this. I think you also want to try to, not hand pick people but you want to make sure you have certain interests and fields of expertise represented. So that might mean making some targeted requests, I hope you might consider sending us a letter of interest, or.

Councilman Van Ho – I also like the other council lady would like to be included on this committee.

Chairwoman Minarik – Pretty soon we'll have to make it 21-25 people. We could always sit in on them too.

President Holzheimer Gail – That was my point. A citizens committee is a citizens committee. Council we have our own committees and I would not, I think there's an ex-officio capacity to be a part of the discussion. I would certainly want the residents to drive. That's your call in terms of setting it up.

Chairwoman Minarik – We will set that up by the next Council meeting so I can announce it with a little more input from you guys. Is there any other final comments?

Councilman Van Ho – Maybe we ought to wait until the second meeting to set it up because we don't know how the elections are going to turn out and you may have turn over on people from our end.

Chairwoman Minarik – I'll be here until November 30th. All this will do is I assume there's interest from this committee that is unopposed for this election, so they will continue it no matter the outcome of November 8th. So we can at least get the process going so it can be in place.

Councilman Van Ho – As the Council President put it so well, it is your committee.

Chairwoman Minarik – For a couple more weeks, yes. Any comments from the audience? Director Frey do you have anything?

Director Frey – No madam chair.

Chairwoman Minarik – The Executive & Finance Committee meeting will start at 7:00 PM.

Councilman Langman moved to adjourn. Councilwoman Scarniench seconded. Yeas: Unanimous.

Meeting adjourned.